



**SPECIAL STUDY REPORT**  
**ON**  
**SERVICE DELIVERY IN KMC HOSPITALS**  
**KARACHI**  
**AUDIT YEAR 2022-23**

---

**AUDITOR-GENERAL OF PAKISTAN**

---



## **Preface**

The Auditor-General conducts audit in terms of Articles 169 and 170 of the Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973 read with Section 10 of the Auditor-General's (Functions, Powers and Terms and Conditions of Service) Ordinance 2001. The special study on "Service Delivery in KMC Hospitals" was carried out accordingly.

The Directorate General Audit, Local Governments, Sindh, conducted special study on Service Delivery in KMC Hospitals, Karachi during April to May, 2023 with a view to report significant findings to the relevant stakeholders. Audit examined the issues of service delivery in KMC hospitals. In addition, Audit also assessed whether the management complied with applicable laws, rules, Sindh Service Delivery Standards, 2017 for hospitals established by Sindh Health Care Commission, Sindh Local Government Act, 2013 and Sindh Hospital Waste Management Rules, 2014. The special study report indicates specific actions that, if taken, will help the management to realize the objectives of the department.

The report has been finalized by incorporating viewpoint of the management in response to the audit observations, whereas PAO did not convene DAC meeting despite pursuance by Audit.

The Special Study Report is submitted to the Governor of Sindh in pursuance of Article 171 of the Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 read with Section 116 of the Sindh Local Government Act, 2013 for causing it to be laid before the Provincial Assembly of the Sindh.

Islamabad  
Dated:

**(Muhammad Ajmal Gondal)**  
Auditor-General of Pakistan



# Table of Contents

<b>Abbreviations and Acronyms .....</b>	<b>i</b>
<b>Executive Summary .....</b>	<b>iii</b>
<b>1. Introduction .....</b>	<b>5</b>
1.1 Karachi Metropolitan Corporation Hospitals.....	5
1.2 Management of KMC Hospitals .....	6
1.3 Purpose of organization .....	6
1.4 Regulatory Framework .....	6
1.5 Legal aspects of the organization.....	7
1.6 Internal control system of organization .....	7
<b>2. Study Defined.....</b>	<b>8</b>
2.1 Objectives of Study.....	8
2.2 Scope of Study .....	8
2.3 Beneficiary of Study .....	8
<b>3. Study Design.....</b>	<b>9</b>
3.1 Time period.....	9
3.2 Data.....	9
3.3 Methodology .....	9
<b>4. Data Analysis.....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>5. Study Results.....</b>	<b>10</b>
5.1 Audit Findings .....	10
<b>6. Recommendations.....</b>	<b>26</b>
6.1 Recommendations for organization .....	26
6.2 Recommendations for policy makers.....	26
<b>Acknowledgement.....</b>	<b>27</b>
<b>Annexures .....</b>	<b>29</b>



## **Abbreviations and Acronyms**

FMD	Find My Doctor
HAIs	Hospital Acquired Infections (HAIs)
ICU	Intensive Care Unit
KMC	Karachi Metropolitan Corporation
M&HS	Medical and Health Services
MSD	Medical Store Depot
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
OT	Operation Theatre
PAO	Principal Accounting Officer
SEH	Spencer Eye Hospital
SHCC	Sindh Health Care Commission
SMH	Sobhraj Maternity Hospital
SOPs	Standard Operating Procedures
SRS	Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed
SSDS	Sindh Service Delivery Standards



## **Executive Summary**

The Directorate General Audit, Local Governments, Sindh conducted Special Study on “Service delivery in KMC Hospitals” from April to May, 2023. Karachi Metropolitan Corporation Hospitals function under the administrative control of Secretary, Local Government & Housing Town Planning Department, Government of Sindh. The hospitals are responsible for providing effective service delivery regarding health to the citizens of Karachi. The audit was conducted in accordance with the INTOSAI Auditing Standards. Main objective of the study was to examine the quality of healthcare services and medical facilities provided to the public of Karachi by three hospitals under KMC, namely Sobhraj Maternity Hospital, Spencer Eye Hospital and Sarfraz Rafiqi Shaheed Hospital as per requirement of Sindh Service Delivery Standards established by Sindh Health Care Commission, Government of Sindh.

The Audit observed that hospitals of Karachi Metropolitan Corporation failed to provide effective health care service delivery to the patients due to non-utilization of budget allocated for various heads and non-posting of officers/staff on vacant posts. The management did not take efforts for operationalization of various non-functional services of the hospitals like emergency services, radiology, pharmacy, ambulance, maternity and eye care services. In addition, non-carrying out of work of repair and maintenance of building, machinery and equipment caused deterioration of service delivery provided to the citizens of Karachi. The key audit findings of the special study along with recommendations are given as follows:

### **Key Audit Findings:**

- i. Non-utilization of budget allocated for various heads.
- ii. Non-posting of doctors, staff and specialists against vacant posts.
- iii. Poor service delivery due to improper administrative and financial management system.
- iv. Non-existence of emergency, ICU, radiology, pharmacy, ambulance, food, security, maternity and eye care services.
- v. Expiry of medicines due to improper storage and Stock Management System.
- vi. Non-implementation of policy for infection control.
- vii. Absence of cleanliness and sanitation system in the hospitals.
- viii. Non-implementation of hospital Waste Management System.

- ix. Non-carrying repair & maintenance work of hospital building, medical equipment and ambulances.

**Audit Recommendations:**

- i. Timely utilization of allocated budget under various heads especially for purchase of medicines, machinery and medical equipment be ensured.
- ii. Posting of doctors, staff and specialists should be made against vacant posts on priority basis.
- iii. The management should ensure proper administrative & financial controls for improving service delivery as per Sindh Service Delivery Standards.
- iv. Various medical services like emergency, ICU, radiology, pharmacy, ambulance, food, security, maternity and eye care should be made operational.
- v. Implementation of proper storage and Stock Management System be ensured.
- vi. Policy for infection control should be implemented in letter and spirit.
- vii. Cleanliness and sanitation system in the hospitals should be ensured.
- viii. Proper hospital Waste Management System should be implemented.
- ix. Repair and maintenance work of hospital building, equipment and ambulances should be ensured.

# **1. Introduction**

## **1.1 Karachi Metropolitan Corporation Hospitals**

The Medical & Health Services Department, KMC is one of the most important departments of Karachi Metropolitan Corporation. The mechanism of providing health services is run through fourteen KMC hospitals, viz; Abbassi Shaheed Hospital, Karachi Institute of Heart Diseases, Sobhraj Maternity Hospital, Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed Hospital, Leprosy Hospital, Landhi Medical Complex, Spencer Eye Hospital, Gizri Maternity Hospital, Gazdarabad General Hospital, Cardiac Emergency Centre Landhi, Cardiac Emergency Centre Shah Faisal, Homeopathic Hospital Nazimabad, Primary Health Care Centre Lyari and Karachi Institute of Kidney Diseases. Following three hospitals were selected for special study purpose.

### **a) Sobhraj Maternity Hospital**

Sobhraj Maternity Hospital (SMH) under the administrative control of Karachi Metropolitan Corporation (KMC) is located in thickly populated area at main Robson Road near Burns Road, Saddar Town Karachi. It was established on 21-07-1928 and is one of the largest maternity hospitals in the city. This 130 bedded hospital has 03 Operation Theatres, Pre & Post-Operative wards, Anti natal and post-natal wards, Labor Room, OPD for gynecology and obstetrics, Paeds OPD, laboratory, ultra sound and vaccination department. In addition, the hospital also provides training opportunities for post-graduate students, house officers, mid-wives and nurses.

### **b) Spencer Eye Hospital**

Spencer Eye Hospital (SEH) under the administrative control of Karachi Metropolitan Corporation (KMC) is situated at Siddique Wahab Road, Lea Market, Lyari town, Karachi. It was established in 1938. This fifty bed hospital began its services for the inhabitants of I.I Chundrigar, SITE, Kharadar, Layari, Kemari, Hawksbay and nearby areas in 1940. It was considered as one of the most reputed hospital for eye diseases in the country. It rendered services in Glaucoma, Laser Vision Correction, Oculoplastic, Medical Retina and Cataract Laser Surgery. The services of the hospital were widely appreciated even by the patients coming from Afghanistan and Iran. The Spencer Hospital was given the status of a teaching institute due to its highly skilled and experienced faculty but due to financial constraints, the turnout of patients has dropped considerably over the last five years.

### **c) Sarfaraz Rafiqi Shaheed Hospital**

Sarfaraz Rafiqi Shaheed Hospital (SRS) is a public sector hospital under the administrative control of Karachi Metropolitan Corporation (KMC). It was established in 1967, which is located at new Challi, opposite Aram Bagh Police Station near Pakistan Chowk, District South, Karachi. It is 100 bedded hospital which provides a range of medical services including indoor and outdoor patients care, diagnostic services, emergency and radiology services, dental and ENT services in addition to general surgical services, besides, the hospital also provides training opportunities to the healthcare professionals. This hospital is declared as emergency center for viral and weather-related problems as heat stroke, congo fever, Crimen-Congo Hemorrhagic fever, dengue fever and Covid Vaccination center along with a Polio Desk.

Since 1967 it was considered as one of the oldest reputed hospital which provided better indoor and outdoor patients care services including general surgical services. However, the hospital has acute shortage of medicines, latest machinery and equipment and technical staff especially doctors and surgeons.

#### **1.2 Management of KMC Hospitals**

KMC hospitals are run by Medical Superintendents who are under the administrative control of Senior Director, Medical and Health Services, KMC and the Metropolitan Commissioner is an executive head of the KMC, appointed by the Government.

#### **1.3 Purpose of organization**

Purpose of organization was to provide various medical services including indoor and outdoor patients care, diagnostic, emergency, radiology services, dental, ENT, maternity and eye services in addition to general surgical services. Further, the hospitals are also providing training opportunities to the healthcare professionals, post graduate students, house officers, mid wives and nurses.

#### **1.4 Regulatory Framework**

- i. Sindh Service Delivery Standards (SSDS), 2017 for Hospitals established by Sindh Health Care Commission (SHCC), Government of Sindh.
- ii. Sindh Local Government Act, 2013
- iii. Local Government and Housing Town Planning Department, Government of Sindh Notification No. RO(LG)/MISC:4(74)/2016 dated. 28.02.2017
- iv. Sindh Hospital Waste Management Rules, 2014

- v. “Code of Ethics” of Practice for Medical and Dental Practitioners as prescribed by the Pakistan Medical & Dental Council
- vi. West Pakistan Building & Roads Department Code-1994
- vii. The Sindh Financial Rules Vol. I & II Revised edition 2004
- viii. Sindh Public Procurement Rules, 2010

### **1.5 Legal aspects of the organization**

The legal framework, functions, standards, procedures for effective health care service delivery for hospitals are provided in Sindh Service Delivery Standards (SSDS), 2017 established by Sindh Health Care Commission (SHCC), Government of Sindh.

### **1.6 Internal control system of organization**

Internal controls systems of hospitals defined in Sindh Service Delivery Standards for Hospitals established by Sindh Health Care Commission (SHCC), Government of Sindh, envisage following controls for effective service delivery;

- i. Inventory Management:** The management of hospitals manage their inventory system manually for proper tracking system of inventory.
- ii. Infection control help desk:** The management of Sarfaraz Rafiqi shaheed hospital has established help desk for Heat Stroke, Rain Emergency, Congo Fever, Crimen-Congo Hemorrhagic fever, Dengue fever & Covid Vaccination center.
- iii. Blood diseases control:** The management of Sobhraj Maternity hospital has established blood testing laboratory in the premises of its own hospital to control spreading of blood disease to other patients.
- iv. Patient Flow Control:** The management of Sobhraj Maternity Hospital manage the flow for ultrasound patients by using first in first out method.
- v. CCTV/Surveillance & Security System:** The management of Sobhraj Maternity hospital has installed CCTV Cameras for monitoring of security.

## **2. Study Defined**

### **2.1 Objectives of Study**

The objectives of the study were to check:

- i. Whether adequate financial and human resources were available and being utilized effectively.
- ii. Whether proper service delivery was being provided to general public.
- iii. Whether the required medical facilities were available for the benefits of patients.
- iv. Whether the Waste Management System was established.
- v. Whether the patients were satisfied from the treatment/services.
- vi. Whether the internal controls in hospitals were operative.
- vii. To examine the financial management system and their operation/effectiveness in hospitals.

### **2.2 Scope of Study**

- i. The study covered period of three years i.e. 2019-20 to 2021-22.
- ii. The services provided by the KMC hospitals were analyzed with the standards as given in Sindh Service Delivery Standards-2017.
- iii. Information was gathered through personal interviews of key personnel of hospitals and KMC
- iv. Visits of Hospitals

### **2.3 Beneficiary of Study**

- i. Karachi Metropolitan Corporation Hospitals
- ii. Local Government and Housing Town Planning Department, Government of Sindh
- iii. General Public of Karachi city

### **3. Study Design**

#### **3.1 Time period**

The special study was conducted from 03-04-2023 to 18-05-2023.

#### **3.2 Data**

Collected information by visiting the Finance & Accounts department, KMC and various sections of hospitals. Audit team also visited other hospitals under the administrative control of KMC. The previous audit reports of hospitals under study were also reviewed to get information about deficient areas of the entities.

#### **3.3 Methodology**

The audit team conducted the special study by visiting the Sobhraj Maternity Hospital, Spencer Eye Hospital and Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed Hospital. The data was extracted by scrutinizing the records pertaining to different sections of hospitals. The releases of budget from finance department, KMC were also checked.

### **4. Data Analysis**

Qualitative and quantitative data analysis was made by scrutinizing following record and data provided during the course of Special Study:

- a. Information collected by interviews with the management.
- b. Quantitative data about budget, medicines & hospital equipment received from respective departments, KMC.
- c. Issued audit findings/observations and obtained their clarifications to evaluate the results.

## 5. Study Results

### 5.1 Audit Findings

#### 5.1.1 Non-utilization of budget allocated for various heads - Rs.372.214 million

As per Para 50 of Notification No.RO(LG)/MISC:4(74)/2016 dated.28-02-2017 issued by Local Government & Housing Town Planning Department, Government of Sindh, “the budget shall as far as possible be a performance budget and it shall make due provision to ensure that the standard of performance in the various activities of the council rises progressively and is not allowed to fall or deteriorate”.

Further, Para-82 ibid stipulates that when the accounts of a council are audited, the audit authority shall, among other matters, review the operation of the budget for the period of audit and point out the financial irregularities, if any in the administration of the budget.

As per para 83(1)(d) that “financial irregularity shall include any extravagance or waste of funds of the council” and (f) “any case of over budgeting or under budgeting”.

During special study on Service Delivery in KMC Hospitals (Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqi Shaheed hospitals), it was observed from the scrutiny of previous three years budget & expenditure statements that management failed to utilize the allocated budget under various heads viz contingency (purchase of medicines, radiology films, stationery etc.), repair & maintenance and capital development. The record revealed that an amount of Rs.531.585 million was allocated for the above purpose, out of which Rs.29.589 million was utilized which was only 5.566% of the total budget. Due to non-utilization of the allocated budget, neither the hiring of professional medical staff on vacant posts could be made nor could the non-functional machinery/equipment be operationalized for proper service delivery of the patients as reflected in the table below. Further details are given in **Annex-A**.

[Amount in Rs.]

Sr. No	Name of Hospital	Period	Total Budget	Total Expenditure	Expenditure % of Total Budget	Savings
1	Sobhraj Maternity Hospital	2019-20 to 2021-22	137,807,500	10,025,947	7.28%	127,781,553
2	Spencer Eye Hospital		99,350,000	7,691,175	7.74%	91,658,825
3	Sarfraz Rafiqi Shaheed Hospital		156,620,000	1,846,331	1.18%	154,773,669
<b>Total Rs.</b>			<b>531,585,000</b>	<b>29,589,400</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>374,214,047</b>

Audit was of the view that non-utilization of allocated budget showed poor administrative and financial management resulting in non-provision of better service delivery to the citizens.

The matter was reported to the management in May 2023. The offices of the Medical Superintendent, Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed hospitals replied that the Financial Advisor KMC was responsible for all financial and accounting matters. Further, due to shortage of funds, KMC could not release budgeted amount to hospitals for purchase of medicines, equipment and repair of building. However, the released amount was utilized by giving priority to the payment of salary and pension. The reply was not tenable as management failed to provide documentary evidence in support of reply. The PAO did not convene DAC meeting till finalization of the report despite issuance of letter dated 16-10-2023, followed by reminders dated 03-11-2023 and 29.12.2023.

Audit recommends fixing responsibility against the person(s) at fault.

(OM # 01)

### **5.1.2 Non-posting of officers and staff**

Para 4.2.1 and 2 of Sindh Service Delivery Standards-2017 established by Sindh Health Care Commission, Karachi states that the hospital is overseen by a Governing Board (Board of Directors/Governors or Representatives of Government Department) which ensure that the hospital is adequately resourced to meet its objectives.

Further, as per Para 50 of notification No.RO(LG)/MISC:4(74)/2016 dated.28.02.2017 issued by Local Government & Housing Town Planning Department, Government of Sindh, that “the budget shall as far as possible be a performance budget and it shall make due provision to ensure that the standard of performance in the various activities of the council rises progressively and is not allowed to fall or deteriorate”.

During special study on Service Delivery in KMC Hospitals (Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed hospitals), it was observed that various posts of technical and non-technical officers/staff viz consultants, medical officers, surgeons, anesthetist, paramedics, nurses, radiologists, pathologists, technicians, pharmacists, mid-wives etc were lying vacant since more than five years. The management did not take serious efforts for filling the vacancies of important technical and non-technical officers/staff due to which citizens were deprived of the proper medical and health care services. Detail is at **Annex-B**.

Audit was of the view that non-filling of vacant posts of officers and staff indicated poor management and weak internal controls.

The matter was reported to the management in May 2023. The offices of the Medical Superintendent, Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed hospitals replied that the matter has already been taken up with higher authority for posting of technical staff including Consultants, Medical Officers, Surgeons, Anesthetist, Paramedics, Nurses, Radiologists, OT Technicians, Laboratory Technicians, Pharmacists, Mid Wives, Ophthalmic Surgeon, Orthopedist, Optometrist, Ophthalmic Aid etc. The PAO did not convene DAC meeting till finalization of the report despite issuance of letter dated 16-10-2023, followed by reminders dated 03-11-2023 and 29.12.2023.

Audit recommends filling of vacant posts on priority basis.

(OM # 02)

### **5.1.3 Poor service delivery due to improper administrative and financial management system**

Para 4.2.1 of Sindh Service Delivery Standards-2017 established by Sindh Health Care Commission, Karachi states that the hospital is overseen by a Governing Board (Board of Directors/Governors or Representatives of Government Department) which is responsible for establishing and reviewing the mission, values and strategic direction of the hospital, fostering a culture of quality improvement.

Para 4.4.3 ibid further states that the accounting system produces reliable financial information regarding all sources of revenues (line budget, grant in aid, user fees, zakat, donations, health insurance fees or others) and expenditure and provides timely and accurate financial reports for decision-making.

During special study on Service Delivery in KMC Hospitals (Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed hospitals), it was observed that the affairs of Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed hospitals were being run without Governing Board (Board of Directors/Governors or Representatives of Government Department)/Health Management Committee. Further scrutiny of record revealed that there was frequent trend of transfer postings of staff and officers and there was no proper system for preparation of annual budget as well as targets.

Audit was of the view that due to improper administration; the citizens were deprived of proper health care facilities which indicated poor management and weak internal controls.

The matter was reported to the management in May 2023. The offices of the Medical Superintendent, Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed hospitals replied that all the administrative and financial matters are dealt by Senior Directors HRM/Medical & Health Services and Financial Advisor, KMC respectively. However, in-charge of the hospital is only responsible for effective operation and service delivery to the patients. The reply was not tenable as the management failed to involve Board of Directors and representatives of health department in various important financial and administrative matters. The PAO did not convene DAC meeting till finalization of the report despite issuance of letter dated 16-10-2023, followed by reminders dated 03-11-2023 and 29.12.2023.

Audit recommends that the management should ensure proper administration to improve service delivery as per Sindh Service Delivery Standards.

(OM # 03)

#### **5.1.4 Non-availability of proper “Emergency & ICU services”**

Para 8.1.1 to 5 of Sindh Service Delivery Standards-2017 established by Sindh Health Care Commission, Karachi, states that the Casualty Department provides safe, timely and efficient live-saving emergency care and minor treatment and surgery for patients.

Further, Para 9.1.1 to 10 ibid states that “the Intensive Care Unit (ICU) is managed by suitably qualified staff and organized to provide safe and efficient care for seriously ill patients who need to be continuously monitored”.

During special study on Service Delivery in KMC Hospitals (Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed hospitals), it was observed that there was no proper facility of casualty department for provision of 24 hours emergency services. Further, for proper service delivery to the patients, the facility of Intensive Care Unit (ICU) for the seriously ill patients under the supervision of trained healthcare professionals with the sophisticated monitoring machines in Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed hospitals was also not available.

Audit was of the view that due to non-availability of proper emergency and ICU services the general public was deprived of health services of seriously ill patients which indicated poor management and weak internal controls.

The matter was reported to the management in May 2023. The offices of the Medical Superintendent, Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed hospitals replied that due to shortage of staff and funds, causality department for 24 hours emergency and Intensive Care Unit (ICU) services to the patients could not be established. However, the matter has been taken up with higher authorities. The PAO did not convene DAC meeting till finalization of the report despite issuance of letter dated 16-10-2023, followed by reminders dated 03-11-2023 and 29.12.2023.

Audit recommends that the management should establish emergency and ICU units in the hospitals on priority basis for provision of better medical services to the critically ill patients.

(OM # 04)

### **5.1.5 Improper provision of Maternity Services**

Para 11.1.3 to 4 of Sindh Service Delivery Standards-2017 established by Sindh Health Care Commission, Karachi states that maternity services provide safe, timely and efficient maternity care for patients with the following services:

- A signed agreement and close professional links with a referral hospital offering more comprehensive services ensures provision of necessary emergency maternity services if these services are not available within the hospital.
- The maternity department has 24-hour on-site cover from qualified medical doctors and an anaesthetist.

During special study on Service Delivery in KMC Hospitals (Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed hospitals), it was observed that there was no proper arrangement of maternity services including 24-hour on-site cover from qualified medical doctors and an anaesthetist in Sobhraj Maternity hospital. Further, there was no facility of close professional links with a referral hospital for provision of necessary emergency maternity services in case of non-availability of such service within the hospital as required under the Sindh Service Delivery Standards.

Audit was of the view that non-provision of proper maternity services in the hospital deprived the general public from maternity services which indicated poor management and weak internal control within the hospital.

The matter was reported to the management in May 2023. The office of the Medical Superintendent, Sobhraj Maternity hospital replied that the matter has already been taken up with higher authorities to overcome the shortage of technical staff. The PAO did not convene DAC meeting till finalization of the report despite issuance of letter dated 16-10-2023, followed by reminders dated 03-11-2023 and 29.12.2023.

Audit recommends provision of proper maternity services in the hospital as per Sindh Service Delivery Standards at the earliest.

(OM # 05)

### **5.1.6 Non-provision of Radiology, Pharmacy and Ambulance Services**

Para 13.1.1 to 9 of Sindh Service Delivery Standards-2017 established by Sindh Health Care Commission, Karachi states that the Radiology services are managed and organised to provide safe and efficient care for patients and support to clinical specialties.

Further, para 14.1.1 to 9 of the above standards stipulates that the pharmaceutical service is managed and organised to provide efficient and effective pharmaceutical services through rational use of drugs within the hospital.

Moreover, as per Para 8.3.5, *ibid*, “safe and adequate facilities and equipment are provided to meet the needs and volume of patients attending the emergency services /casualty department. There is a canopy over the casualty entrance used by ambulances”.

During special study on Service Delivery in KMC Hospitals (Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed hospitals), it was observed that due to acute shortage of technical staff, non-functioning of X-Ray machines and non-availability of pharmacy services, the patients were deprived of better radiology services and availability of medicines on subsidized rates. Further, ambulances for the Sarfaraz Rafiqui Shaheed and Spencer Eye Hospitals were found condemned and non-operational since many years due to which the ambulance service could not be provided to the patients. Pictorial evidence is given at **Annex-C**.

Audit was of the view that due to non-provision of radiology, pharmacy and emergency services, the patients suffered badly which indicated poor management.

The matter was reported to the management in May 2023. The offices of the Medical Superintendent, Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqi Shaheed hospitals replied that due to shortage of funds radiology, pharmacy and ambulance services could not be provided. However, the matter has already been taken up with higher authorities for provision of sufficient funds to restore/continue such facilities. The PAO did not convene DAC meeting till finalization of the report despite issuance of letter dated 16-10-2023, followed by reminders dated 03-11-2023 and 29.12.2023.

Audit recommends that the management should take steps for provision of radiology, pharmacy and ambulance services on priority basis.

(OM # 06)

### **5.1.7 Improper Storage and Stock Management**

Para 14.3.1 to 11 of Sindh Service Delivery Standards-2017 established by Sindh Health Care Commission, Karachi states that “the stock is managed to ensure that medications are current, safe and continuously available to meet the needs of clinical staff and patients. Medicines are stored on shelves enabling protection from the adverse effects of light, dampness, temperature, freedom from vermin, insects & adequate ventilation. Medicines for emergency use are stored in sealed tamper evident containers in all patient areas.

During special study on Service Delivery in KMC Hospitals (Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqi Shaheed hospitals), it was observed that medicines received from main store or donated were neither properly stored nor protected from the adverse effects of light, dampness and extreme temperature as per above given standards. Available pharmacy refrigerators were found non-functional due to which efficacy of the costly and precious medicine was affected. Non-professional stock control system was being adopted by the management of above hospitals. Pictorial evidence is given at **Annex-D**.

Audit was of the view that non-adopting of proper storage and stock management system was deviation of Sindh Service Delivery Standards which indicated poor management and weak internal controls.

The matter was reported to the management in May 2023. The offices of the Medical Superintendent, Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqi Shaheed hospitals replied that hospitals has maintained the record of all items procured through

budget and donations. The reply was not tenable as the management failed to provide evidence in support of reply. The PAO did not convene DAC meeting till finalization of the report despite issuance of letter dated 16-10-2023, followed by reminders dated 03-11-2023 and 29.12.2023.

Audit recommends that proper storage and stock management system be adopted to protect the medicines from adverse effects, besides fixing responsibility against the person(s) at fault.

(OM # 07)

### **5.1.8 Non-implementation of Policy for Infection Control**

Para 15.1.1 to 16 of Sindh Service Delivery Standards-2017 established by Sindh Health Care Commission, Karachi states that “the organization designs and implements a coordinated program to reduce the risks of infections in patients, visitors/attendants, contractors and staff. The hospital establishes an infection control program designed to prevent or reduce the incidence of Hospital Acquired Infections (HAIs) based on current scientific knowledge and evidence. Responsibility for coordinating the infection control program is assigned to an infection control committee with representatives of all relevant disciplines and departments. Infection risks, rates and trends are tracked, analyzed and reported by the committee.

During special study on Service Delivery in KMC Hospitals (Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed hospitals), it was observed that the hospitals did not implement an infection control program and constitute a committee designed to prevent the incidence of infections.

Audit was of the view that non-implementation of policy for infection control indicated poor management.

The matter was reported to the management in May 2023. The offices of the Medical Superintendent, Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed hospitals replied that due to shortage of funds, infection control program could not be implemented and committee could not be constituted for preventing the incidence of infections. The PAO did not convene DAC meeting till finalization of the report despite issuance of letter dated 16-10-2023, followed by reminders dated 03-11-2023 and 29.12.2023.

Audit recommends that the policy for infection control may be implemented at the earliest.

(OM # 08)

### **5.1.9 Lack of cleanliness and sanitation system in the Hospitals**

Chapter-17 of Sindh Service Delivery Standards-2017 established by Sindh Health Care Commission, Karachi states that “all hospital facilities, equipment and supplies are kept clean and safe for patients, visitors/attendants.

Para-17.1 stipulates that “Staff should follow written policies and procedures and schedules for Disinfection and cleaning of all equipment, furniture, floors, walls, storage areas and other surfaces and areas. Cleaning of all inpatient and outpatient, (OT, Labour Room, Emergency Ward, Dressing Room, Laboratory and ICU)”

Further, as per para-17.2 to 6 “all hospital premises are free from litter and other refuse. Sufficient covered, clean dustbins are provided for patients, visitors/attendants and staff and the dustbins are emptied on a regular basis. Equipment, floors and walls are free from bodily fluids, dust and grit and the masonry is intact. Cleaners are trained and provided with sufficient appropriate equipment, chemical disinfectant and work according to cleanliness and sanitation policies and procedures. Laundry staff is trained with separation of clean and dirty linen”.

During special study on Service Delivery in KMC Hospitals (Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqi Shaheed hospitals), it was observed that hospitals were functioning without proper cleanliness of their equipment, furniture, floors, walls, surfaces and supplies. During the physical verification, it was also noticed that OT, Wards, OPDs were not cleaned and no dustbins were available in the hospitals. Pictorial evidence is given at **Annex-E**.

Audit was of the view that non-cleanliness and sanitation of hospital premises, various wards and equipment indicated poor management and weak internal controls.

The matter was reported to the management in May 2023. The offices of the Medical Superintendent, Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqi Shaheed hospitals replied that due to shortage of funds and janitorial staff, proper cleaning of wards and OPD/OT rooms could not be made up to acceptable standards. However, the matter has already been taken up with higher authorities for provision of funds and posting of janitorial staff. The PAO did not convene DAC meeting till finalization of the

report despite issuance of letter dated 16-10-2023, followed by reminders dated 03-11-2023 and 29.12.2023.

Audit recommends that management should take practical efforts for cleanliness and sanitation of the hospitals, besides, fixing responsibility on the person(s) at fault.

(OM # 09)

### **5.1.10 Non-implementation of hospital waste management system**

Rule-3 of Sindh Hospital Waste Management Rules, 2014 states that every hospital owner, occupier, operator shall be responsible for the management of the hospital waste generated by it till its final disposal in accordance with the provision of the Act and these rules.

Further, para 18.1.1 of Sindh Service Delivery Standards-2017 established by Sindh Health Care Commission, Karachi states that “the clinical and other infectious or injurious waste is handled, stored and disposed of to minimize harm and risk of infection/injury to patients, visitors, contractors, staff and the community”.

During special study on Service Delivery in KMC Hospitals (Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqi Shaheed hospitals), it was observed that management of the hospitals failed to formulate and implement hospital waste management plan, in violation of above rules due to which chances of risk of infection to the patients, visitors and staff itself could not be ruled out.

Audit was of the view that non-implementation of hospital waste management was a violation of above rule provisions which indicated poor management.

The matter was reported to the management in May 2023. The offices of the Medical Superintendent, Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqi Shaheed hospitals replied that despite shortage of staff and funds, provisions of hospital waste management system are regularly followed and waste management team has now been constituted. The reply was not tenable as the management failed to provide documentary evidence in support of reply. The PAO did not convene DAC meeting till finalization of the report despite issuance of letter dated 16-10-2023, followed by reminders dated 03-11-2023 and 29.12.2023.

Audit recommends formulation and implementation of hospital waste management system for clean health delivery in the hospitals.

(OM #10)

### **5.1.11 Non-provision of food / refreshment services**

The Chapter No.22 of Sindh Service Delivery Standards-2017 established by Sindh Health Care Commission, Karachi states that the “hospital shall provide food services in accordance to the policies set by the respective hospital and statutory requirements where applicable. Documented policies and procedures appropriate to the provision of quality and safe food services shall be made accessible to all staff”. Further para 7 of chapter 22 stipulates that “if food services are outsourced as cafeteria, then there shall be a formal contract agreement between the management and Cafeteria operator stating the requirements of the services”.

During special study on Service Delivery in KMC Hospitals (Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqi Shaheed hospitals), it was observed that management of the hospitals failed to provide food/refreshment services to the patients as per applicable rules. Further, no facility of cafeteria was available in all three hospitals in violation of above service delivery standards.

Audit was of the view that non-provision of food and cafeteria services to the patients and staff of the hospitals indicated poor management.

The matter was reported to the management in May 2023. The offices of the Medical Superintendent, Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqi Shaheed hospitals replied that due to shortage and non-release of funds from finance department, KMC, food or refreshment services could not be provided to the indoor patients. However, the matter has been taken up with higher authorities for provision of funds. The PAO did not convene DAC meeting till finalization of the report despite issuance of letter dated 16-10-2023, followed by reminders dated 03-11-2023 and 29.12.2023.

Audit recommends that the management should provide food and cafeteria services to the patients and staff of the hospitals as per provision of rules on priority basis.

(OM # 11)

### **5.1.12 Non-provision of proper security services**

Para 24 of Sindh Service Delivery Standards-2017 established by Sindh Health Care Commission, Karachi states that “The hospitals must have the security services to provide secure and safe environment for the patients, new born and the serving staff (medics, nurses and paramedics). There must be written security plan and SOPs for the

internal and external security measures for the patients, working staff and attendants during day and night”.

During special study on Service Delivery in KMC Hospitals (Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed hospitals), it was observed that management of the hospitals failed to provide proper security services for secured and safe environment to the patients, new born babies, attendant of the patients, visitors and the serving staff of the hospitals, in violation of above rule.

Audit was of the view that non-provision of proper security services in the hospitals was violation of the rule which indicated poor management.

The matter was reported to the management in May 2023. The offices of the Medical Superintendent, Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed hospitals replied that due to shortage of funds and staff, proper security could not be provided by hiring security personnel from the security firms. However, few employees of the hospitals are deputed for performing security services. Matter has already been taken up with higher authorities for provision of funds and security staff. The PAO did not convene DAC meeting till finalization of the report despite issuance of letter dated 16-10-2023, followed by reminders dated 03-11-2023 and 29.12.2023.

Audit recommends that the management should provide proper security services in the hospitals on priority basis.

(OM # 12)

### **5.1.13 Deterioration of hospital building due to non-execution of repair and maintenance work**

According to Rule 2.41(i) of West Pakistan Building & Roads Department Code-1994 “Those which as a matter of routine are carried out every year and which are usually of the same quantity from time to time, such as white washing of a building or painting of water pipes or tanks are known as annual maintenance and repair (ii) those which are not done every year but are due after 4 years are known as quadrennial repairs. This includes such as painting of doors, windows and wood work in roof (iii) such occasional special repairs as become necessary from time to time, and which may have to be carried out between times of periodical repairs like renewal of roof, renewal of door etc”

During special study on Service Delivery in KMC Hospitals (Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed hospitals), it was observed that the management of hospitals did not carry the work of repair and maintenance of the building especially roof of OT, store, family planning unit, wash rooms, sewerage lines and lifts. Refusal/debris were found scattered everywhere especially at the main entrance of the hospitals, wards, OTs and the corridors, in violation of above rules. Pictorial evidence is given at **Annex-F**.

Audit was of the view that deterioration of the hospital buildings due to non-carrying out of repair and maintenance work since long indicated poor management and weak internal controls.

The matter was reported to the management in May 2023. The offices of the Medical Superintendent, Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed hospitals replied that due to shortage of funds, repair and maintenance of hospital building could not be made. However, matter has already been conveyed to the higher authorities for repair and maintenance of hospital building. The PAO did not convene DAC meeting till finalization of the report despite issuance of letter dated 16-10-2023, followed by reminders dated 03-11-2023 and 29.12.2023.

Audit recommends that management should take efforts for repair and maintenance of the hospital buildings on priority basis.

(OM # 13)

#### **5.1.14 Un-authorized allotment of hospital space to M/s FMD for “online OPD”**

According to Rule-23 of General Financial Rules, Volume-I, that “Every Government Officer should realized fully and clearly that he will be held personally responsible for any loss sustained by Government through fraud or negligence on his part and that he will also be held personally responsible for any loss arising from fraud or negligence on the part of any other Government Officer to the extent to which it may be shown that he contributed to the loss by his own action or negligence.”

During special study on Service Delivery in KMC Hospitals (Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed hospitals), it was observed that the management of Rafique Shaheed Hospital unauthorizedly allotted space measuring approximately 480 Sq yd at the first floor of Hospital to M/s “Find My Doctor” (FMD), a non-Governmental Organization (NGO), for setting up its on-line consultation services. The permission was accorded by the Metropolitan Commissioner vide Office order

No.Secy/MC/KMC/2022/181 dated.11.8.2022 with the condition that the Senior Director, Medical & Health Service, KMC may be contacted for setting up the detailed terms and conditions for the establishment of the clinic. However, neither MOU and agreement with M/s FMD was signed nor any approval from the Administrator, KMC was obtained. During physical verification of space allotted, it was also noticed that neither any doctor was available nor any services were being provided to public but only a pharmacy store on commercial basis was established and being run by M/s FMD in the hospital premises.

Audit was of the view that undue favor was extended to the NGO without following due procedure and rules for setting its business which indicated poor management and weak internal controls.

The matter was reported to the management in May 2023. The office of the Medical Superintendent, Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed hospital replied that space was allotted after approval of competent authority. However, the matter will be reviewed and if any irregularity found, action will be taken as per rules. The reply was not tenable as the management failed to provide approval of competent authority for allotment of space to M/s FMD. The PAO did not convene DAC meeting till finalization of the report despite issuance of letter dated 16-10-2023, followed by reminders dated 03-11-2023 and 29.12.2023.

Audit recommends inquiry into the matter for fixing responsibility on the person(s) at fault.

(OM # 14)

### **5.1.15 Un-justified issuance of expired medicines**

Para 14.1.17 of Sindh Service Delivery Standards-2017 established by Sindh Health Care Commission, Karachi states that “The pharmacy service provides a regular prescription monitoring service, locally, to ensure the safe, effective and economic use of medicines which also includes the physical examination of drugs to assess their quality and expiry dates”.

During special study on Service Delivery in KMC Hospitals (Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed hospitals), it was observed from the stock entry, issue register & wrappers pasted with stock pages that the management of Rafique Shaheed Hospital issued medicines after their expiry dates and some of the medicines were still shown as, balance in stocks whose shelf life had also been expired. Management did not take any action against the official(s) responsible for issuance of

expiry medicines and non-issuance of available balance to the needy patients in time. Detail is at **Annex-G**.

Audit was of the view that issuance of expired medicines put life of patients at risk and non-issuance of medicines within useful life to the needy patients deprived them of their beneficial use which indicated poor management and weak internal controls.

The matter was reported to the management in May 2023. The office of the Medical Superintendent, Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed hospital replied that committee has been constituted to check the factual position and fix the responsibility and submit recommendations. The reply was not tenable as the management failed to provide evidence in support of reply. The PAO did not convene DAC meeting till finalization of the report despite issuance of letter dated 16-10-2023, followed by reminders dated 03-11-2023 and 29.12.2023.

Audit recommends fixing responsibility against the person(s) a fault.

(OM # 15)

#### **5.1.16 Non-repairing of hospital equipment and ambulances**

According to Rule-23 of General Financial Rules, Volume-I, “Every Government Officer should realized fully and clearly that he will be held personally responsible for any loss sustained by Government through fraud or negligence on his part and that he will also be held personally responsible for any loss arising from fraud or negligence on the part of any other Government Officer to the extent to which it may be shown that he contributed to the loss by his own action or negligence.”

During special study on Service Delivery in KMC Hospitals (Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed hospitals), it was observed that essential medical equipment, ambulance and other vehicles of Spencer Eye Hospital were lying non-functional/off-road since many years (Pictorial evidence is given at **Annex-H**). The management neither got the equipment/vehicles repaired nor demanded additional funds for the said purpose to make them functional for the service delivery of patients. Detail is enclosed at **Annex-I**.

Audit was of the view that non-repairing of important medical equipment, ambulance and other vehicles indicated poor management and weak internal controls.

The matter was reported to the management in May 2023. The office of the Medical Superintendent, Spencer Eye hospital replied that due to shortage of funds

medical equipment and vehicles of hospital could not be repaired. However, efforts are being made for repair of all non-functional medical equipment and vehicles. The PAO did not convene DAC meeting till finalization of the report despite issuance of letter dated 16-10-2023, followed by reminders dated 03-11-2023 and 29.12.2023.

Audit recommends repairing of the medical equipment and ambulance on priority basis.

(OM # 16)

### **5.1.17 Non-provision of Eye Care Services**

Para 4.2.1 and 2 of Sindh Service Delivery Standards-2017 established by Sindh Health Care Commission, Karachi states that “The hospital committee is responsible for establishing and reviewing the mission, values and strategic direction of the hospital, fostering a culture of quality improvement, ensuring the hospital is adequately resourced to meet its objectives, ensuring compliance with all relevant legislative requirements, monitoring and evaluating the achievement of strategic and annual results”.

During special study on Service Delivery in KMC Hospitals (Sobhraj Maternity, Spencer Eye and Sarfraz Rafiqi Shaheed hospitals), it was observed that Spencer Eye Hospital has not been providing the important eye care services and treatment like Glaucoma, Laser Vision Correction, Oculoplastic, Medical Retina and Cataract Laser Surgery to the patients for last many years. Further, no surgery especially Cornea transplant is being made in the hospital due to shortage of qualified staff and as well as latest equipment.

Audit was of the view that non-provision of treatment of eye diseases in the hospital indicated poor service delivery and weak internal controls.

The matter was reported to the management in May 2023. The office of the Medical Superintendent, Spencer Eye hospital replied that due to shortage of funds and staff, facility for eye care service including surgery (especially cornea) could not be provided. However, the matter has been taken with higher authority for establishing eye care services. The PAO did not convene DAC meeting till finalization of the report despite issuance of letter dated 16-10-2023, followed by reminders dated 03-11-2023 and 29.12.2023.

Audit recommends that management should take practical steps for provision of eye care services to the patients on priority basis.

(OM # 17)

## **6. Recommendations**

### **6.1 Recommendations for organization**

- i. Timely utilization of allocated budget under various heads especially for purchase of medicines, machinery and medical equipment be ensured.
- ii. Posting of doctors, staff and specialists should be made against vacant posts on priority basis.
- iii. The management should ensure proper administrative & financial controls for improving service delivery as per Sindh Service Delivery Standards.
- iv. Various medical services like emergency, ICU, radiology, pharmacy, ambulance, food, security, maternity and eye care should be made operational.
- v. Implementation of proper storage and Stock Management System be ensured.
- vi. Policy for infection control should be implemented in letter and spirit.
- vii. Cleanliness and sanitation system in the hospitals should be ensured.
- viii. Proper hospital Waste Management System should be implemented.
- ix. Repair and maintenance work of hospital building, equipment and ambulances should be ensured.

### **6.2 Recommendations for policy makers**

#### **Planning & execution for establishing of service delivery standards**

(a) The old medical equipment and machinery which has completed its useful life needs replacement with the modern equipment and machinery on priority basis.

(b) Filling of vacant posts of consultants, medical officers, surgeons, anesthetist, paramedics, radiologists, pathologists, technicians, pharmacists, midwives, nurses etc through laid down procedures.

## **Acknowledgement**

The department of Auditor-General of Pakistan expresses appreciation to the management and staff of KMC hospitals for the assistance and cooperation extended to the auditors during this assignment.



---

## **Annexures**

---



**Annex-A**  
**[Para: 5.1.1]**

**Detail of Total Budget & Expenditure During FY 2019-20 to 2021-22  
in Sobhraj Maternity Hospital, KMC**

[Amount in Rs.]

Sr. No	FY	Description	Non-Salary		Development	Total	Saving	Expenditure % of Total Budget
			Contingency	Repair & Maintenance				
1	2021-22	Budget	19,650,000	1,425,000	12,550,000	33,625,000	28,981,552	13.810
		Expenditure	4,633,573	9,875	-	4,643,448		
2	2020-21	Budget	21,100,000	1,375,000	24,780,000	47,255,000	45,215,525	4.316
		Expenditure	2,039,475	-	-	2,039,475		
3	2019-20	Budget	36,655,000	1,512,500	18,760,000	56,927,500	53,584,476	5.872
		Expenditure	3,335,639	7,385	-	3,343,024		
<b>Grand Total</b>		<b>Budget</b>	<b>77,405,000</b>	<b>4,312,500</b>	<b>56,090,000</b>	<b>137,807,500</b>	<b>127,781,553</b>	<b>7.275</b>
		<b>Expenditure</b>	<b>10,008,687</b>	<b>17,260</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>10,025,947</b>		

**Detail of Total Budget & Expenditure During FY 2019-20 to 2021-22  
in Spencer Eye Hospital**

[Amount in Rs.]

Sr. No	FY	Description	Non -Salary		Development	Total	Saving	Expenditure % of Total Budget
			Contingency	Repair & Maintenance				
1	2021-22	Budget	13,030,000	1,170,000	2,850,000	17,050,000	13,458,658	21.064
		Expenditure	3,591,342	-	-	3,591,342		
2	2020-21	Budget	14,730,000	1,170,000	26,300,000	42,200,000	40,259,530	4.598
		Expenditure	1,940,470	-	-	1,940,470		
3	2019-20	Budget	14,930,000	1,170,000	24,000,000	40,100,000		5.385

**Detail of Total Budget & Expenditure During FY 2019-20 to 2021-22  
in Spencer Eye Hospital**

[Amount in Rs.]

Sr. No	FY	Description	Non -Salary		Development	Total	Saving	Expenditure % of Total Budget
			Contingency	Repair & Maintenance				
		Expenditure	2,159,363	-	-	2,159,363	37,940,637	
<b>Grand Total</b>		<b>Budget</b>	<b>42,690,000</b>	<b>3,510,000</b>	<b>53,150,000</b>	<b>99,350,000</b>		
		<b>Expenditure</b>	<b>7,691,175</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>7,691,175</b>	<b>91,658,825</b>	<b>7.741</b>

**Detail of Total Budget & Expenditure During FY 2019-20 to 2021-22  
in Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed Hospital**

[Amount in Rs.]

Sr. No	FY	Description	Non -Salary		Development	Total	Saving	Expenditure % of Total Budget
			Contingency	Repair & Maintenance				
1	2021-22	Budget	11,950,000	-	-	11,950,000	11,561,000	3.255
		Expenditure	389,000	-	-	389,000		
2	2020-21	Budget	117,700,000	-	-	117,700,000	116,584,712	0.948
		Expenditure	1,115,288	-	-	1,115,288		
3	2019-20	Budget	14,400,000	1,000,000	11,570,000	26,970,000	26,627,957	1.268
		Expenditure	342,043	-	-	342,043		
<b>Grand Total</b>		<b>Budget</b>	<b>144,050,000</b>	<b>1,000,000</b>	<b>11,570,000</b>	<b>156,620,000</b>	<b>154,773,669</b>	<b>1.179</b>
		<b>Expenditure</b>	<b>1,846,331</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>1,846,331</b>		

**NON-POSTING OF OFFICERS AND STAFF**

<b>1. Sobhraj Maternity Hospital, KMC</b>					
<b>Sr. No</b>	<b>Name of Post</b>	<b>BPS</b>	<b>Sanctioned Strength</b>	<b>Working Strength</b>	<b>Vacant Position</b>
1	Associate Consultant Child (SCUG)	18	1	0	1
2	Associate Consultant Physician	18	1	0	1
3	Consultant Pathologist	18	1	0	1
4	Consultant Radiology	18	1	0	1
5	Consultant Ultrasound	18	1	0	1
6	Associate Surgeon (SCUG)	18	1	0	1
7	Senior Anesthetist (SCUG)	18	3	0	3
8	Senior Anesthetist (KMC)	18	1	0	1
9	Senior Registrar	17	3	0	3
10	RMO (SCUG)	17	7	6	1
11	RMO (KMC)	17	12	9	3
12	Medical Officer (SCUG)	17	5	2	3
13	Nursing Superintendent	17	2	0	2
14	Pharmacist	17	1	0	1
15	Nursing Instructor	17	1	0	1
16	Nursing Sister	16	10	2	8
17	Medical Technologist	16	1	0	1
18	Staff Nurse	14	20	12	8
19	Laboratory Technician	12_16	3	2	1
20	Accountant (SCUG)	11	1	0	1
21	LHV	8_16	5	0	5
22	Mid Wife	7_10	7	2	5
23	Mid Wife	6	16	0	16
24	Electrician	6	2	0	2
25	Driver	5	10	4	6
26	Generator Operator	4	3	2	1
27	Junior Electrician	4	1	0	1
28	Dark Room Attendant	3	1	0	1
29	Senior Attendant	2_6	17	12	5
30	Lift Operator	2	3	1	2
31	Sanitary Worker	1	35	17	18
32	Worker	1	20	13	7
33	Attendant-III	2_6	11	7	4
34	Ayah	1_5	37	6	31
35	Chowkidar	1	12	8	4
<b>Total</b>			<b>256</b>	<b>105</b>	<b>151</b>

<b>2. Spencer Eye Hospital, KMC</b>					
<b>Sr. No</b>	<b>Name of Post</b>	<b>BPS</b>	<b>Sanctioned Strength</b>	<b>Working Strength</b>	<b>Vacant Position</b>
1	Dy: Medical Superintendent	18	1	0	1
2	Associate Ophthalmic Surgeon	18	5	0	5
3	Senior Anesthetist	18	2	0	2
4	Director Optometry	18	1	0	1
5	Senior Orthopedist	17	1	0	1
6	RMO (SCUG)	17	4	0	4
7	Surgical Medical Officer	17	1	0	1
8	Medical Officer (SCUG)	17	7	5	2
9	Medical Officer (KMC)	17	7	5	2
10	Senior Registrar	17	2	0	2
11	Nursing Superintendent	17	1	0	1
12	Pharmacist	17	2	1	1
13	Optometrist	16	1	0	1
14	Nursing Sister	17	15	1	14
15	Staff Nurse	16	25	20	5
16	Theatre Technician	9	4	2	2
17	Ophthalmic Aid	8	16	14	2
<b>Total</b>			<b>95</b>	<b>48</b>	<b>47</b>

<b>3. Sarfaraz Rafiqui Shaheed Hospital, KMC</b>					
<b>Sr. No</b>	<b>Name of Post</b>	<b>BPS</b>	<b>Sanctioned Strength</b>	<b>Working Strength</b>	<b>Vacant Position</b>
1	Consultant Anesthetist	20	2	0	2
2	Deputy MS	18	2	0	2
3	Surgeon Incharge	18	1	0	1
4	Consultant Surgeon ENT	18	1	0	1
5	Associate Consultant Physician	18	1	0	1
6	Consultant Pathology	18	1	0	1
7	Consultant Radiology	18	1	0	1
8	Consultant Skin	18	1	0	1
9	Nursing Superintendent	17	1	0	1
10	RMO	17	6	0	6
11	RMO	17	14	12	2
12	Medical Officer	17	12	7	5
13	Senior Registrar Ultra Sound	17	1	0	1
14	Pharmacist	17	3	2	1
15	Bio Chemist	17	1	0	1
16	Senior Registrar	17	2	1	1
17	Nursing Sister	17	10	9	1

<b>3. Sarfaraz Rafiqui Shaheed Hospital, KMC</b>					
<b>Sr. No</b>	<b>Name of Post</b>	<b>BPS</b>	<b>Sanctioned Strength</b>	<b>Working Strength</b>	<b>Vacant Position</b>
18	Staff Nurse	16	20	13	7
19	Theatre Technician	9	5	4	1
20	Lab Technician	9	6	2	4
21	Assistant OT Technician	7	3	0	3
22	Assistant X-Ray Technician	7	6	2	4
23	Assistant Lab Technician	7	1	0	1
24	Dispenser/Dresser	6 & 9	9	6	3
25	Mid Wife/Nurse Aid	6	2	1	1
26	Lab Boy	5	4	3	1
27	Junior Electrician/Wire Man	3 & 4	2	1	1
28	Dispatch Rider	3	2	1	1
29	Worker	1	13	10	3
30	Ayah	1	10	1	9
31	Sanitary Worker	1	20	8	12
<b>Total</b>			<b>163</b>	<b>83</b>	<b>80</b>

**NON-FUNCTIONING OF X-RAY MACHINES**

**Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed Hospital**



**IMPROPER STORAGE AND STOCK**



**Spencer Eye Hospital**



**Sobhraj Maternity Hospital**

**ABSENCE OF CLEANLINESS AND SANITATION SYSTEM IN THE  
HOSPITALS**



**Sobhraj Maternity Hospital**



**Sarfraz Rafiqi Shaheed Hospital**

**NON-CARRYING OUT OF REPAIR AND MAINTENANCE WORK IN  
HOSPITALS**

**Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed Hospital**



**UN-JUSTIFIED ISSUANCE OF EXPIRED MEDICINES**

<b>Sr. No</b>	<b>Name of Medicine</b>	<b>Balance quantity as on</b>	<b>Quantity Issued</b>	<b>Date of Issuance</b>	<b>Date of Expiry</b>	<b>Ref Stock Page No</b>	<b>Remarks</b>
1	Tab. Amlodipine 5mg	1800 Dt.15.2.2020	1,800	18.05.2020	April,2020	7	Med. Issued after Expiry period
2	Tab. Artemether 40/240 mg	2020 Dt.22.10.2019	2,020	18.05.2020	Jan,2020	8	Med. Issued after Expiry period
3	Tab.Artemther 80/480mg	1990 Dt.15.2.2020	1,990	18.05.2020	May,2020	9	Med. Issued after Expiry period
4	Tab. Atenolol 50mg	2100 Dt.15.2.2020	2,100	18.05.2020	May,2020	10	Med. Issued after Expiry period
5	Tab.Carvedilol 12.5mg	300 Dt.1.7.2019	0	NA	June,2020	11	Balance available till 5/23 due to which shelf life expired
6	Tab. Folicid BP 5 mg	1000 Dt.26.8.2019	1,000	04.01.2020	April,2020	12	huge balance shown as issued after the period of two years
7	Syp. Metronidazole 60ml	1600 Dt.15.2.2020	1,600	18.05.2020	May,2020	16	Med. Issued after Expiry period
8	Cotton Roll	225	0	NA	NA	23	Balance

<b>Sr. No</b>	<b>Name of Medicine</b>	<b>Balance quantity as on</b>	<b>Quantity Issued</b>	<b>Date of Issuance</b>	<b>Date of Expiry</b>	<b>Ref Stock Page No</b>	<b>Remarks</b>
	400g	Dt.1.11.2019					available till 5/23 due to which shelf life expired
9	Wallagona Bulb	15 Dt.1.7.2019	0	NA	NA	24	Balance available till 5/23 due to which shelf life expired

**NON-REPAIRING OF HOSPITAL EQUIPMENT AND AMBULANCE**



**Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed Hospital**



**Spencer Eyes Hospital**

**Sarfraz Rafiqi Shaheed Hospital**



**NON-REPAIRING OF HOSPITAL EQUIPMENT AND AMBULANCE**

<b>S. No</b>	<b>Name of Item</b>	<b>Quantity</b>	<b>Condition</b>	<b>Period</b>	<b>Place of Availability</b>
1	Wheel Chairs	4	Not working	Since 5 Years	MS Room
2	Phaco Machine	1	Out of Order		Major OT Room
3	Micro Scope	1			
4	Anesthesia Machine	1			
5	Oximeter	1			
6	Drainage	1			
7	Pulse Meter	1			
8	BP Operatus	1			
9	Stethoscope	1			
10	Stat Fax (3300)	1	Non-Functional	Since 5 Years	
11	Abacus Plus	1			
12	Photo Colorimeter	1			
13	Contrifuge Machine	1			
14	Slit Lamp	2	Non-Functional	Since 5 Years	Room- 6 & 7
15	Tono Meter (Con Contact)	1		Since 5 Years	Room No.6
16	Electronic Torch	1			
17	Welchayn Diagnostic Set Well Mounted	1	Non-Functional	Since 5 Years	Room No.3
18	Lenso Meter	1			
19	Ophtalmo Scope	1			
20	Ophtalmo Scope (NITZ)	1			
21	Cambridge Bio Red Digital Lab	1			
22	Slit Lamp	2			
23	Ultra Scale Imaging System	1			
24	Indirect	1	Non-Functional	Since 5 Years	General Ward
25	Tono Meter	1			
26	Service Vehicle Eye Camp BUS	1	Off-Road	Since 5 Years	GS-8670
27	Service Vehicle for Local Eye Camp	1	Off-Road		GL-5501
28	Service Vehicle for Shifting of Hospital goods		Off-Road		GL-5502
29	Ambulance		Off-Road		EX-2949